



January 25, 2017

The Plymouth Downtown Development Authority Saxton's RFP sub-committee met with three potential developers for the former Saxton's property at Ann Arbor Trail and Deer St. on Tuesday, Jan. 24.

The interviews were with:

1 p.m. Union Street Development

3 p.m. DevMar Development

5 p.m. Harmonie Park Development

Following presentations by all the developers and follow-up questions by the sub-committee, the five-member committee decided to continue discussion with Union Street Development and Harmonie Park Development.

Below is the scoring and rankings by the sub-committee for each developer.

The sub-committee will be meeting soon to discuss the next steps in the process toward development of the site.

All three developer presentations are being made available on the Downtown Development Authority website at [www.downtownplymouth.org](http://www.downtownplymouth.org)

## Union Street Development - Evaluation Form Rankings

City of Plymouth

January 24, 2017

Question	Ranking Scores of Sub-Committee Members					TOTAL	Average Ranking by Question
	A	B	C	D	E		
Q1. How the concept/vision achieves goals in RFP?	4	5	5	5	5	24	4.80
Q2. How the building is compatible with downtown, Kellogg Park, historic structures, residential properties?	4	5	5	5	5	24	4.80
Q3. How will the concept energize the street, attract people to downtown, be a gateway, catalyze additional development?	4	5	5	5	4	23	4.60
Q4. Is project viable? Is concept flexible? Are modifications possible?	3	4	4	4	4	19	3.80
Q5. Most successful public/ private partnerships? Include parking deck?	3	3	4	3	4	17	3.40
Q6 Breadth of project team? Parking deck consultant?	4	4	5	5	5	23	4.60
Q7. Other projects with public engagement? Engagement over requirements?	3	4	5	3	4	19	3.80
Q8. How public/private partnership will work?	3	3	4	4	3	17	3.40
Total	28	33	37	34	34	<b>33.2</b>	<b>4.15</b>
Average Ranking by Sub-Committee Member	3.50	4.13	4.63	4.25	4.25		<b>4.15</b>

## DevMar Development - Evaluation Form Rankings

City of Plymouth

January 24, 2017

Question	Ranking Scores of Sub-Committee Members					TOTAL	Average Ranking by Question
	A	B	C	D	E		
Q1. How the concept/vision achieves goals in RFP?	3	4	2	3	4	16	3.20
Q2. How the building is compatible with downtown, Kellogg Park, historic structures, residential properties?	3	4	1	3	3	14	2.80
Q3. How will the concept energize the street, attract people to downtown, be a gateway, catalyze additional development?	3	4	2	3	4	16	3.20
Q4. Is project viable? Is concept flexible? Are modifications possible?	4	4	3	3	5	19	3.80
Q5. Most successful public/ private partnerships? Include parking deck?	4	4	3	4	4	19	3.80
Q6 Breadth of project team? Parking deck consultant?	3	4	2	3	4	16	3.20
Q7. Other projects with public engagement? Engagement over requirements?	3	3	3	3	2	14	2.80
Q8. How public/private partnership will work?	4	3	3	3	5	18	3.60
Total	27	30	19	25	31	<b>26.4</b>	<b>3.30</b>
Average Ranking by Sub-Committee Member	3.38	3.75	2.38	3.13	3.88		<b>3.30</b>

## Harmonie Park - Evaluation Form Rankings

City of Plymouth

January 24, 2017

Question	Ranking Scores of Sub-Committee Members					TOTAL	Average Ranking by Question
	A	B	C	D	E		
Q1. How the concept/vision achieves goals in RFP?	3	4	4.5	3	5	20	3.90
Q2. How the building is compatible with downtown, Kellogg Park, historic structures, residential properties?	4	4	4	3	4	19	3.80
Q3. How will the concept energize the street, attract people to downtown, be a gateway, catalyze additional development?	4	4	5	5	5	23	4.60
Q4. Is project viable? Is concept flexible? Are modifications possible?	5	4	3	4	5	21	4.20
Q5. Most successful public/ private partnerships? Include parking deck?	5	5	5	5	5	25	5.00
Q6 Breadth of project team? Parking deck consultant?	5	4	5	5	5	24	4.80
Q7. Other projects with public engagement? Engagement over requirements?	5	4	5	3	5	22	4.40
Q8. How public/private partnership will work?	5	4	4	4	5	22	4.40
Total	36	33	35.5	32	39	<b>35.1</b>	<b>4.39</b>
Average Ranking by Sub-Committee Member	4.50	4.13	4.44	4.00	4.88		<b>4.39</b>

## Summary - Evaluation Form Rankings

City of Plymouth

January 24, 2017

Question	Average Ranking Scores		
	Union Street	DevMar	Harmonie Park
Q1. How the concept/vision achieves goals in RFP?	4.80	3.20	3.90
Q2. How the building is compatible with downtown, Kellogg Park, historic structures, residential properties?	4.80	2.80	3.80
Q3. How will the concept energize the street, attract people to downtown, be a gateway, catalyze additional development?	4.60	3.20	4.60
Q4. Is project viable? Is concept flexible? Are modifications possible?	3.80	3.80	4.20
Q5. Most successful public/ private partnerships? Include parking deck?	3.40	3.80	5.00
Q6 Breadth of project team? Parking deck consultant?	4.60	3.20	4.80
Q7. Other projects with public engagement? Engagement over requirements?	3.80	2.80	4.40
Q8. How public/private partnership will work?	3.40	3.60	4.40
TOTAL Ranking	33.20	26.40	35.10
Average Ranking by Question	4.15	3.30	4.39